

# **Board of Management**

Meeting	Chairs Committee
Date and time	Thursday 23 November 2017 at 8.30 a.m.
Location	Board Room, 1 Inverness Campus

College Secretary 15 September 2017

# **AGENDA**

# **Welcome and Apologies**

# **Declarations of Interest**

# 1. MINUTES

Chairs Committee held on 14 September 2017

# 2. GOVERNANCE

- a. Outstanding actions
- b. Board Development Plan

Covering report by Board Secretary

# 3. SECTOR CONSULTATIONS

- a. Ending Period Poverty
- b. Rural and remoteness funding review Covering report by Board Secretary

# 4. STANDING ITEM - ISSUES FROM CHAIRS

#### 5. UHI STRUCTURE

Verbal update by Chair

#### 6. SMT REPORT

Verbal update by Principal

# 7. AOCB

# 8. DATE OF NEXT MEETING

Thursday 22 February 2018 - 8.30 a.m.



# **Board of Management**

# MINUTES of the MEETING of the CHAIRS COMMITTEE held in the Board Room, 1 Inverness Campus on Thursday 14 September 2017

**PRESENT:** Sarah Burton, Brian Henderson (VC), Neil Stewart, Steve

Walsh, John Wilson

CHAIR: Neil Stewart
APOLOGIES: Hazel Allen
OBSERVER: Lindsey Mitchell

ATTENDING: Principal

Director of Organisational Development (item 1)

Secretary to the Board of Management

The Chair referred to the extra paper which had been circulated on the procedure for establishing and reviewing the Principal's objectives, performance and salary. It was agreed that this item be taken as item 1.

# 1. PROCEDURE FOR ESTABLISHING AND REVIEWING THE PRINCIPAL'S OBJECTIVES, PERFORMANCE AND SALARY

The Director of Organisational Development introduced the paper and gave some background to the PDR process across the college. There was a discussion on how to include the input of staff and students to the appraisal process, which was a requirement under the Code of Good Governance for Scotland's Colleges. It was suggested that the IIP framework would allow the views of staff and students to be gathered through a random selection of participants from these two groups.

It was **AGREED** that the Chair of the Board, Chair of PR&R and the SIM should meet with the Principal to determine his objectives for the coming year. The Strategic Plan set out the key objectives for the College, and therefore the Principal. Further objectives would be identified through the vision which the new Principal had for the College. E mail approval would be sought from the PR&R Committee in advance of the proposed objectives being submitted to the Board of Management meeting in October

# 2. MINUTES

The minutes of the Meeting of the Committee held on 17<sup>th</sup> August 2017 was **ACCEPTED** as a correct record, was **APPROVED** and signed by the Chair.

# **Matters arising**

Update – National Bargaining

The Chair advised that National Bargaining had been discussed at FERB on 13<sup>th</sup> September. By 2021/22 there would be a significant deficit across the partnership and a range of measures would require to be taken forward to deal with this issue. It was imperative that UHI started to start planning now for the projected financial position in 2021/22.

The Chair referred to a presentation which the Director of Finance, Fiona Mustarde had made to the meeting of FERB and asked the Secretary to the Board to circulate this to Board Members.

#### 3. TERMS OF REFERENCE

The Secretary to the Board introduced the terms of reference for the Chairs, Search and Nomination and the Performance, Review and Remuneration committees, highlighting a number of suggested changes. The previous review of the terms of reference had taken place in June 2015.

The Committee **RECOMMENDED** to the Board of Management approval of the terms of reference for the Chairs, Search and Nomination and Performance, Review and Remuneration Committee subject to a minor change in the frequency of meetings of the PR&R committee.

# 4. GOVERNANCE

# a. Outstanding actions

The Committee reviewed the progress on the outstanding governance actions. Good progress was being made with the timelines due to be met for the majority of issues, with actions only outstanding in relation to the completion of the Remuneration Module by members of the PR&R Committee and the appraisal of a further 4 board members by the Chair.

The Committee **NOTED** the position

# b. Board evaluation – combined responses

All the Board members who had been in post for a period of more than 12 months had completed the board evaluation exercise. The Board Secretary had combined the responses into one document for the consideration of the committee. The next stage would be to develop an action plan to progress the issues which had been raised.

The Committee discussed the combined responses and the SIM offered to produce a summary of the responses to allow the Secretary to the Board to identify actions to be taken forward.

# 5. STRATEGIC DIALOGUE MEETING – 8<sup>TH</sup> NOVEMBER

The Board Secretary referred to the draft agenda and programme for the Strategic Dialogue meeting with SFC on 8<sup>th</sup> November. SFC had identified governance and financial sustainability as one of the three topics for discussion. Two further topics would be chosen by the College. The Chair would be part of the discussion.

It was **AGREED** that the Principal would reflect on the two further topics to be suggested by the College and discuss this with the Chair in due course. The involvement of additional board members would be determined once the two topics had been agreed.

# 6. STANDING ITEM – ISSUES FROM CHAIRS

The Chair asked if any of the Chairs wished to raise anything for discussion. There were no items requiring discussion at the present time

Signed by the Chair:		
Date:	<u></u> _	

7.

**DATE OF NEXT MEETING** 

Thursday 23 November 2017- 8.30 a.m.



# **Board of Management**

Subject/Title:	Governance
Author: [Name and Job title]	Fiona Ambrose, Board Secretary
Meeting:	Chairs Committee
Meeting Date:	Thursday 23 November at 8.30 a.m.
Date Paper prepared:	Wednesday 15 November
Brief Summary of the paper:	The Chairs Committee has been regularly updated on progress in meeting all the requirements of the Code of Good Governance for Scotland's Colleges. Following the Board Evaluation exercise carried out over summer, the identified actions have been combined with the actions identified in the External Review of Board effectiveness into a 2017-18 development plan.
Action requested: [Approval, recommendation, discussion, noting]	The Committee is asked to note the outstanding actions in the Code of Good Governance action list and to consider how it wishes to take forward the actions within the 2017-18 Development Plan
Link to Strategy: Please highlight how the paper links to, or assists with::  compliance partnership services risk management strategic plan new opportunity/change	Compliance with the Code of Good Governance for Scotland's Colleges
Resource implications:	No
Risk implications:	Yes If yes, please specify: Operational: Non compliance Organisational: Non compliance
Equality and Diversity implications:	N/A
Consultation: [staff, students, UHI & Partners, External] and provide detail	N/A

Status – [Confidential/Non confidential]	Non confiden	tial		
Freedom of Information Can this paper be included in "open" business* [Yes/No]	Yes			
*If a paper should <b>not</b> be include	ded within "ope	en" busir	ness, please highlight below the reason.	
Its disclosure would substantia prejudice a programme of rese	•		Its disclosure would substantially prejudice the effective conduct of public affairs (S30)	
Its disclosure would substantia the commercial interests of any organisation (S33)			Its disclosure would constitute a breach of confidence actionable in court (S36)	
Its disclosure would constitute of the Data Protection Act (\$38			Other (please give further details)	
For how long must the paper be either as the time which needs which needs to be met.)	,	•		

Further guidance on application of the exclusions from Freedom of Information legislation is available via

http://www.itspublicknowledge.info/ScottishPublicAuthorities/ScottishPublicAuthorities.asp~and~

http://www.itspublicknowledge.info/web/FILES/Public\_Interest\_Test.pdf

#### Governance

# **Executive summary**

Code of Good Governance for Scotland's Colleges - action list

The Chairs Committee, over the last 18 months has been considering the actions required to comply with the Code of Good Governance for Scotland's Colleges. The action list has been updated to show the one outstanding action which relates to Board Evaluation and Training. Specifically the appraisal of Board Members has still to be completed by the Chair.

#### Board evaluation

The externally facilitated review of Board Effectiveness which was completed in March 2017 had a number of actions and the annual Board evaluation which was carried out over summer also identified a number of actions to improve board performance.

# Development plan 2017

The actions from the external effectiveness review and the board evaluation exercise have been combined into one document as the Development Plan 2017.

#### Recommendation

The committee is asked to consider how it wishes to take forward the 4 actions from the annual Board appraisal process approved by the Board of Management in October 2017

# YEAR ENDED 31 JULY 2017

Code	Principal	Action required	Responsible person	Timescale/ Comments	
Section	Section C: Accountability				
Risk I	<b>l</b> anagement				
C11	The board must set the risk appetite of the body and ensure there is an appropriate balance between risk and opportunity and that this is communicated via the principal to the body's management team.	Process to set the risk appetite to be undertaken	Chair of Audit Committee	Process to be undertaken at October Board meeting  COMPLETE	
Audit	Committee				
C17	The Audit Committee terms of reference must provide for the committee to sit privately without any non-members present for all or part of a meeting if they so decide.	Include in review of terms of reference	Board Secretary	Audit Committee – September 2017 COMPLETE	
Remu	neration Committee				
C19	Members must undertake the online training module for Remuneration Committees provided by College Development Network within one month of appointment.	Provide link to Training module on Governance Hub  All members of PR&R to complete the training module	Board Secretary  Neil Stewart, John Wilson, Brian Henderson, Hazel Allen, Sarah Burton, Steve Walsh	COMPLETE	
C20	The board must have a formal procedure in place for setting the remuneration of the principal by a designated committee of non-executive members. The board may wish to supplement this by taking evidence from a range of sources. In particular, staff and students should have a role in gathering and submitting evidence in relation to the college principal to the relevant committee.	Glasgow Kelvin College procedure to be adapted for use by IC	Board Secretary	Procedure adapted ready for October Board COMPLETE	
Staff	Governance				
C27	The board must comply with the nationally agreed college sector <u>Staff Governance Standard</u> .	Board of Management needs to confirm that it will comply	Board Secretary	Include on Agenda of Board meeting in October COMPLETE	
Section	n D: Effectiveness				
Board	Members				
D9	The college board must ensure a clear process is in place to set and agree personal performance measures for the principal. This process should seek the views of students and staff. The chair, on behalf of the board, should monitor, review and record the principal's performance, at least annually, against the agreed performance measures.	Glasgow Kelvin procedure to be adapted for use by IC	Board Secretary	End August 2017 for approval by the board of management meeting in October COMPLETE	
Board	Board Secretary				
D14	Where the board secretary is unable to attend every board and committee meeting, while the board secretary retains overall responsibility, proper arrangements must be made to cover the role with a person who is fully able to discharge the role effectively.	Arrangements to be put in place to cover role of Board Secretary	Acting Principal in discussion with Chair	End July 2017 PA to the Principal to cover - COMPLETE	
D16	The board must ensure arrangements are in place to deal with a board secretary's potential or real conflicts of interest.	Role to be covered if Board Secretary declares conflict of interest	Chair in discussion with Acting Principal	PA to the Principal to cover - COMPLETE	

Code Principal		Action required	Responsible person	Timescale/ Comments
Board	Member Appointment, Induction and Training			
D20	The board secretary should support the chair in the provision of relevant training and development opportunities for board members, which should be tailored to meet board members skills and needs.		Chair + Board Secretary	By end December 2017
Board	Evaluation			
D22	Extension of the term of office of board appointments requires evidence and the board must ensure appropriate mechanisms are in place to support this.	Board chair to carry out appraisals per D25 and submit to Board Secretary for recording	Chair	Ongoing
D23	The board must keep its effectiveness under annual review and have in place a robust self-evaluation process. The board must send its self-evaluation to its funding body and publish them online.		Board Secretary Board Secretary	COMPLETE
D25	The board must ensure all board members are subject to appraisal of their performance, conducted at least annually, normally by the chair of the board.	Chair to complete evaluations – Hazel Allen, Helen Miller, Steve Walsh, Jaci Douglas, Gavin Ross, Gabbi Starr	Chair	Ongoing

13 November 2017



# INVERNESS COLLEGE UHI – BOARD OF MANAGEMENT DEVELOPMENT PLAN

	RECOMMENDATION	ACTION	RESPONSIBLE PERSON	TIMESCALE	Comments
	ecommendations 1 – 5 - from the Extern ne Board of Management in March 2017	ally facilitated review of Bo	ard Effectiveness ca	rried out by Henderson	Loggie and approved by
1	As part of the UHI Court review of governance arrangements, specific clarification should be sought on how decisions taken at FERB and UHI Court, which may have implications for Inverness College UHI, will be translated in key messages which can be disseminated for discussion at the College Board of Management and potentially shared with staff	Clarification will be sought on how this issue can be progressed as part of the UHI Court review of governance arrangements	Chair of the Board of Management	30 April 2017 (extended to Summer 2018)	the review is still ongoing and further changes may be made so timeline extended
2	A revision of the financial reporting format should be a focus for the next Director of Corporate Services (or equivalent); with specific reference to the distillation of key messages (for the F&GP committee and potentially other committees	This will be taken forward as part of the review of financial reporting within the college	Next Director of Corporate Services or equivalent	31 December 2017	Director of Finance appointed July 2017. Discussions have taken place with the Chair of F&GP and this will be actioned in full at the December F&GP meeting
3	The previous work conducted to consider the Board's risk appetite should be revisited and finalised	The work will be progressed following discussion and agreement on the Executive Lead for risk management	To be determined	To be determined	Board of Management on 26 October 2017 agreed to adopt the UHI Risk Statement and Risk Appetite and to be part of further work to be

					undertaken by UHI in 2018
4	The requirement for audit committee members to meet in private with the external auditors annual should be added to the Audit Committee terms of reference when this is next updated	This will be taken forward as part of the scheduled review of all committee terms of reference	Board Secretary	31 October 2016	New terms of reference approved by Board of management on 26 October 2017 COMPLETE
5	Clarity should be sought from both FERB and the UHI Court regarding the process for achieving compliance with Section D27 of the Code of Good Governance	This will be taken forward to ensure compliance with the Code	Board Secretary	30 April 2017	Board Chair appraisal completed by Chair of Court, April 2017 COMPLETE
F	Recommendations 6 – 9 - from the annual	Board appraisal process ap	oproved by the Board	d of Management in Octob	per 2017
6	What more could the board do to be open and transparent?	Board members to engage more in ambassadorial role	All Board members	ongoing	
7	Are we learning and sharing enough from other boards?	Chair to raise this in the first instance through FERB and then consider the wider college sector.	Chair of the Board of Management	Next Meeting FERB	
8	How could we improve and develop our system of induction, training and assessment of board members?	Board Secretary and a few Board members to review the current induction process and materials	Board Secretary	End Feb 2018	
9	Do I think our committee structure enhances our scrutiny work or does it slow us down or draw us into too much detail?	Chairs Committee to consider how to improve the process	Board Secretary	End Feb 2018	



# **Board of Management**

Subject/Title:	Sector Consultations a. Ending period poverty b. Rural and remoteness funding
Author: [Name and Job title]	Fiona Ambrose, Board Secretary
Meeting:	Chairs Committee
Meeting Date:	Thursday 23 November at 8.30 a.m.
Date Paper prepared:	Wednesday 15 November
Brief Summary of the paper:	The Chairs Committee and the Board of Management have not in the past been made aware of sector consultations. Two consultation documents are attached. The Committee is asked to simply note these two consultations and to determine whether in the future, it would wish Management to provide input to enable an appropriate committee, or the Board of Management (subject to consultation deadlines) to consider sector consultations.
Action requested: [Approval, recommendation, discussion, noting]	To note the two consultations and determine how to deal with sector consultations in the future
Link to Strategy: Please highlight how the paper links to, or assists with::  compliance partnership services risk management strategic plan new opportunity/change	N/A
Resource implications:	Yes Cost of providing free sanitary services and the amount the college might receive in the future from rurality funding
Risk implications:	Yes If yes, please specify: Operational: Organisational: Rurality funding
Equality and Diversity implications:	N/A
Consultation: [staff, students, UHI & Partners, External] and provide detail	N/A

Status – [Confidential/Non confidential]	Non confiden	tial		
Freedom of Information Can this paper be included in "open" business* [Yes/No]	Yes			
*If a paper should <b>not</b> be include	ded within "ope	en" busir	ness, please highlight below the reason.	
Its disclosure would substantia prejudice a programme of rese	•		Its disclosure would substantially prejudice the effective conduct of public affairs (S30)	
Its disclosure would substantially prejudice the commercial interests of any person or organisation (S33)			Its disclosure would constitute a breach of confidence actionable in court (S36)	
Its disclosure would constitute of the Data Protection Act (\$38			Other (please give further details)	
For how long must the paper be either as the time which needs which needs to be met.)				

Further guidance on application of the exclusions from Freedom of Information legislation is available via

 $http://www.itspublicknowledge.info/ScottishPublicAuthorities/ScottishPublicAuthorities.asp\ \textbf{and}$ 

http://www.itspublicknowledge.info/web/FILES/Public\_Interest\_Test.pdf



A proposal for a Bill to ensure free access to sanitary products, including in schools, colleges and universities.

Consultation by

# Monica Lennon MSP

Member of the Scottish Parliament for Central Scotland August 2017

# **CONTENTS**

	Page
Foreword by Monica Lennon MSP	3
How the consultation process works	5
Aim of the proposed Bill	6
Background	6
Menstruation in Scotland – Facts and Statistics	6
Types of Sanitary Products	6
Period stigma – what's the big deal?	7
Periods and education	8
Period poverty	9
Action to end period poverty – in Scotland and around the world	10
Current regulation on sanitary products	12
Scottish Parliament/Government action to date	14
Why Legislate?	15
Detail of the proposed Bill	16
What the Bill will do	16
Universal right to access free sanitary products	16
Free sanitary products in schools, colleges and universities	17
Potential impacts of the Bill	19
Financial implications	19
Equalities	21
Sustainable Development	22
Questions	23
How to respond to this consultation	28

#### **FOREWORD**

Menstruation is a natural bodily function of women and young girls, yet it continues to be a taboo subject.

Across the world, millions of women and girls are ostracised during their monthly periods and some are banished to sleep alone in huts, to miss school and made to feel dirty and inferior. Menstrual bleeding isn't dangerous or shameful. It's completely normal. What *is* dangerous and shameful is the failure of governments around the world to challenge this prevailing gendered inequality, especially when it risks lives.

Here in Scotland, we are fortunate that these extreme attitudes and customs are alien to us. Nonetheless, it is to our shame that menstruation is still discussed in hushed voices and that menstrual healthcare and hygiene is not embedded in our health and education systems.

Having a period is something which the vast majority of women and girls of reproductive age experience nearly every month. Access to sanitary products to absorb the flow of menstrual blood is essential for health, hygiene and full participation in daily life. Periods are unique to each individual and vary in terms of flow, duration and frequency. Some people will require to use fewer products than others but it is important that sanitary products are used safely and not used for longer than recommended.

Despite the importance of sanitary products to maintaining health, their availability and affordability is variable, and menstruation can cause financial and practical challenges.

Women and girls, at different times in their lives, may find it difficult to access or afford the sanitary products they need for a variety of reasons. They may have no money or income of their own and even when they do, many young people have told us sanitary products are not always easy to obtain within educational premises. In some schools, pupils who need sanitary products are required to ask a member of staff to provide them.

In general, low wages or a restriction of income, including through welfare sanctions, can make it very difficult to manage menstruation. Poverty inevitably leads to 'period poverty.' The indignity of period poverty was recently dramatized in the BAFTA award-winning film *I, Daniel Blake* in which, in a desperate scene, a young mother is seen shoplifting essential sanitary products. The choice between feeding your children or yourself and keeping yourself clean and healthy during menstruation is one which no woman should face. The solution is a political one.

Other circumstances which make menstruation a difficult experience include homelessness, coercive, controlling and violent relationships and health conditions such as endometriosis (affecting 1 in 10 women) which can cause extremely painful and heavy periods in some cases. Some trans people may also experience difficulties in accessing sanitary products.

I believe that Scotland can lead the way in tackling what we have come to recognise in our own communities as period poverty, and that's why I intend to introduce a legislative duty on Scottish Ministers to develop a universal system in Scotland which will provide free sanitary products for anyone who needs them.

My proposal also includes a statutory duty on schools, colleges and universities to provide free sanitary products on their campuses for their students.

In doing so, Scotland can end the silence and stigma that surrounds menstruation and will remove gendered barriers. This is a big step towards creating a fairer and more equal society.

I look forward to hearing your responses and views on these proposals.

Monica Lennon MSP August 2017



Monica Lonnon.

#### HOW THE CONSULTATION PROCESS WORKS

This consultation relates to a draft proposal I have lodged as the first stage in the process of introducing a Member's Bill in the Scottish Parliament. The process is governed by Chapter 9, Rule 9.14, of the Parliament's Standing Orders which can be found on the Parliament's website at:

http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/parliamentarybusiness/17797.aspx

At the end of the consultation period, all the responses will be analysed. I then expect to lodge a final proposal in the Parliament, along with a summary of those responses. If that final proposal secures the support of at least 18 other MSPs from at least half the political parties or groups represented in the Parliamentary Bureau, and the Scottish Government does not indicate that it intends to legislate in the area in question, I will then have the right to introduce a Member's Bill.

A number of months may be required to finalise the Bill and related documentation. Once introduced, a Member's Bill follows a three-stage scrutiny process, during which it may be amended or rejected outright. If it is passed at the end of the process it becomes an Act.

At this stage, therefore, there is no Bill, only a draft proposal for legislation.

The purpose of this consultation is to provide a range of views on the subject matter of the proposed Bill, highlighting potential problems, suggesting improvements, and generally refining and developing the policy. Consultation, when done well, can play an important part in ensuring that legislation is fit for purpose.

The consultation process is being supported by the Scottish Parliament's Non-Government Bills Unit (NGBU) and will therefore comply with the Unit's good practice criteria. NGBU will also analyse and provide an impartial summary of the responses received.

Details on how to respond to this consultation are provided at the end of the document.

Additional copies of this paper can be requested by contacting me at Monica Lennon MSP, M1.19, Scottish Parliament, Edinburgh, EH99 1SP. My office can also be contacted by telephone on 0131 348 6484 or by email at <a href="monica.lennon.msp@parliament.scot">monica.lennon.msp@parliament.scot</a>

Enquiries about obtaining the consultation document in any language other than English or in alternative formats should also be sent to me.

An online copy is available on the Scottish Parliament's website (www.parliament.scot) under <a href="Parliamentary Business/Bills/Proposals for Members">Parliamentary Business / Bills / Proposals for Members</a> Bills.

#### AIM OF THE PROPOSED BILL

The aim of this proposed Bill is to ensure that all those who menstruate, including women, girls and trans people who have periods, are able to access sanitary products during menstruation, at no cost, as and when they are required. This will help to prevent people experiencing period poverty. In order to achieve this, the proposed Bill will include a series of measures to improve the accessibility of sanitary products in Scotland.

#### BACKGROUND

#### Menstruation in Scotland – facts and statistics

Menstruation, or periods, usually start around the age of 13<sup>1</sup> and the average age of menopause is 50 years old<sup>2</sup>. The number of girls and women in Scotland within this age-range (using data from mid-2015) is estimated to be around 1,302,000<sup>3</sup>.

The average length of a menstrual cycle is 26.8 days<sup>4</sup> meaning that the average menstruating female experiences 13.6 menstrual cycles each year. Since the average length of a period is five days<sup>5</sup>, the average menstruating female has 68 menstruating days each year. Therefore, the total annual number of menstruating days in Scotland is approximately 89 million.

While menstruation is predominately experienced by women and girls, it is also experienced by some trans people. Access to sanitary products should be made available to all those who menstruate, regardless of gender identity, and all approaches taken to improving access to sanitary products should be trans inclusive.

# Types of sanitary products

Just like periods themselves, the types of sanitary products which women use and prefer vary, depending on the individual. There are a variety of types of sanitary pads and tampons that can be purchased, in a range of sizes and shapes to fit individual need. Some women may prefer to use reusable pads, which are considered to be more environmentally friendly, and some also use menstrual cups which can be reused over a much longer period of time.

It's generally recommended that products should be changed every three to five hours, so an average individual can be expected to regularly use up to four or five tampons or towels per day.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Source: http://biobank.ctsu.ox.ac.uk/crystal/field.cgi?id=2714

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Source: http://biobank.ctsu.ox.ac.uk/crystal/field.cgi?id=3581

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Source: https://www.nrscotland.gov.uk/files/statistics/population-estimates/mid-15-cor-12-13-14/15mype-cahb-tab1.xlsx. For these purposes, half the 13-year olds and half the 50-year olds have been included.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Source: http://biobank.ctsu.ox.ac.uk/crystal/field.cgi?id=3710

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Source: NHS Choices

# Period stigma - what's the big deal?

Despite the fact that there are approximately 1.3 million people in Scotland who collectively experience almost 90 million days of menstrual bleeding every year, periods remain a taboo subject. Bleeding and cramps apparently aren't topics for polite conversation – so, more often than not, discussing periods happens in a hushed tone or not at all. Understanding this underlying cultural attitude about periods is crucial to understanding why access to menstrual sanitary products remains an issue in Scotland in 2017.

Recent media stories about the stigma of menstruation in parts of the world such as Nepal have sparked controversy due to the reported deaths<sup>6</sup> of several women over the past two years because of the practice of removing women from society during their period. The practice of "Chhaupadi" involves thousands of women and girls moving to makeshift huts, removed from their society, for the duration of their period because of beliefs about the so-called 'impurity' of menstrual blood.

While such extreme behaviour might not exist in Scotland, a 2016 survey by ActionAid<sup>7</sup> revealed that a third of British women are embarrassed about their periods. And recent research to mark 2017 World Menstrual Hygiene Day also revealed that one in four women in the UK, aged between 16 and 39, don't understand their menstrual cycle<sup>8</sup>. Even if you do have a good insight into your own cycle, the onset of menstruation can still happen unexpectedly.

The squeamishness which can accompany discussion of women's bodies is an undeniable part of why menstruation and period poverty has never before been such a widely discussed issue at decision-making level.

Prior to my member's business debate on this topic in September 2016, the only other mention of 'tampons' in the Scottish Parliament chamber, according to the *Official Report*, was a 2004 debate in which they were part of a list of sewage-related debris found on beaches.

Why has such an important a subject, which affects such a significant proportion of the Scottish population, received only one mention in 17 years of our Parliament's debating history? Without doubt, the silence and stigma around menstrual bleeding and women's bodies remains a significant cultural barrier to successfully addressing what happens when people cannot access these vital products. For as long as national policy and debate remains ignorant or silent on the issues affecting women and girls, then government outcomes will continue to fall well short in meeting their needs.

7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> <a href="http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/asia/nepalese-teenager-dies-banished-menstruation-hut-shed-period-cycle-tulasi-shahi-a7833056.html">http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/asia/nepalese-teenager-dies-banished-menstruation-hut-shed-period-cycle-tulasi-shahi-a7833056.html</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> http://www.huffingtonpost.co.uk/entry/british-woman-too-embarrassed-to-talk-about-periods-action-aid\_uk\_5747ff03e4b03e9b9ed5a43b

https://www.actionaid.org.uk/blog/news/2017/05/24/1-in-4-uk-women-dont-understand-their-menstrual-cycle

#### Periods and education

In partnership with the Scottish Youth Parliament, consultation with 15 MSYPs and their constituents revealed that young people believe a lack of information and education in the current curriculum around menstruation is a key factor in the taboo status of periods. Former Equalities Committee Deputy Convener and current Vice Chair Suki Wan MSYP said: "Many feel embarrassed to speak up on the topic and as such don't feel comfortable voicing their concerns about pricing and provision. I believe that if this taboo status is broken down there will be much more productive discussion on the matter, and much more done to aid those in need." (December, 2016).

A significant finding of the YouGov research, commissioned by ActionAid last year, was that more than 3.5 million girls and women in the UK had missed school or work because of their period, yet only 27 per cent were honest about the cause of absence, with the majority (65 per cent) reluctant to state that menstruation was the reason.

Further anecdotal evidence about absenteeism caused by periods caused a media stir in March 2017, when schoolgirls in Leeds were revealed to be missing school days because they couldn't afford sanitary protection. They were having to resort to using toilet paper and even socks as replacements for sanitary products<sup>9</sup>. One girl admitted she had to tape toilet roll to her underwear as a replacement for sanitary products, and misses school every month when she has her period. The organisation *Freedom4Girls* raised concerns after being contacted by a school in Leeds which was worried about teenage girls' attendance. The group, originally set up to collect sanitary products for women in Kenya, is now doing the same for women and girls in West Yorkshire.

The potential impact of young people missing school, or facing difficulty managing their menstruation while they are in education, has worrying implications for the long-term impact on attendance rates, educational outcomes and their physical health, as PE tends to be a subject skipped by schoolgirls when they are menstruating – a problem which can continue into adulthood with women avoiding sporting activities <sup>10</sup>

Official Scottish Government statistics on the attendance record of pupils show that boys and girls have an almost identical record of attendance until around S2, around the average age most girls will begin menstruating. At this point, the attendance rate of girls drops slightly compared to their male peers. Thereafter, the gap remains throughout the rest of secondary school until S6.<sup>11</sup> Although this is a correlation along gender lines, more research will need to be conducted in Scotland before it can be established whether this slightly poorer attendance rates in girls is related to menstruation.

The problem of girls missing out on education due to inadequate access to sanitary products is more commonly associated with developing countries. There is a wealth

10 https://bettyforschools.co.uk/news/period-taboo-research

Education/AttendanceAbsenceDatasets/atttab2015 - see Table 1.3 and Chart 1.1.

<sup>9</sup> http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-39266056

<sup>11</sup> http://www.gov.scot/Topics/Statistics/Browse/School-

of academic research into the gender gap in education around the world, with many studies specifically focusing on girls' experience of menstruation while at school. In

addition to issues arising because of lack of sanitation, issues of embarrassment and stigma were also found to be significant factors affecting girls' lack of involvement in school during their period – with lack of access to sanitary products being a significant point of anxiety in this.<sup>12</sup>

People should not face disadvantage because of menstruation anywhere in the world, and it is a scandal that this should be occurring in a developed, wealthy country like Scotland in 2017, where we have an advanced state school system and economic infrastructure. I believe through the grassroots and political campaigning already underway here, that Scotland can lead the way on this issue, particularly to ensure that those who menstruate will never have to miss out on their education because they can't access sanitary products.

# **Period poverty**

Poverty in Scotland is a growing problem, increasing by two per cent overall last year, according to official Scottish Government statistics. It means that after housing costs are taken into account, there are 1.05 million people in Scotland, including more than one in four children (260,000) living in poverty. Child poverty rose by four per cent in 2015-16 and 64 per cent of adults in poverty also live in a working household<sup>13</sup>.

Figures from the Trussell Trust show that food bank use in Scotland has increased by nine per cent in the last year and is now at a record high, <sup>14</sup> while additional anecdotal evidence on the increasing problem of poverty in Scotland is also found in a recent report from the Educational Institute of Scotland (EIS) which revealed rising levels of poverty and inequality in Scottish schools. It stated that more than half of teachers have had to use their own money to provide food and other basic essentials for pupils <sup>15</sup>.

As the cost of living continues to rise and wages stagnate, it's unsurprising that families on low incomes are struggling to afford the basic necessities – which includes the cost of sanitary products as well as food and heating.

As mentioned in the foreword, the specific issue of period poverty was featured in the hard-hitting 2016 film *I, Daniel Blake* by Ken Loach. It explores the devastating financial impact of benefit sanctions currently operated by the UK Government. The film features a female character, with two young children, who is forced into a desperate financial situation after her benefit payments are reduced. On screen, we

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Sommer, Marni, et al. "A time for global action: addressing girls' menstrual hygiene management needs in schools." *PLoS medicine* 13.2 (2016): e1001962.

Mason, Linda, et al. "'We Keep It Secret So No One Should Know'—A Qualitative Study to Explore Young Schoolgirls Attitudes and Experiences with Menstruation in Rural Western Kenya." *PloS one* 8.11 (2013): e79132.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Source: http://www.gov.scot/Publications/2017/03/2213/0

<sup>14</sup> Source: http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-scotland-39697481

<sup>15</sup> http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-scotland-40524112

see her go without food and sanitary products and in an act of desperation she steals sanitary products from a shop.

Far from being just a dramatization in a film, the choice between food and other essential items has become an agonising reality for far too many women in Scotland,

as the Trussell Trust and other charities have confirmed. Despite the fact that a pack of sanitary pads can be found in most supermarkets for a couple of pounds and might not seem like a huge expense – when you have no or very little income, it can be insurmountable.

This was well illustrated recently in the *Daily Record*, in coverage of the story of Shauna – a mum from Dundee who struggled to afford the cost of sanitary products to cope with post-natal bleeding after the birth of her son when her tax credits payment was delayed and her husband's pay wasn't due until the end of the month<sup>16</sup>.

No-one should have to rely on the kindness of strangers to be able to access essential items. Giving people the ability to access sanitary products for free could help to ease the pressure on household budgets for families on low incomes.

# Action to end period poverty - in Scotland and around the world

The campaign to improve access to sanitary products is not just confined to Scotland or the Scotlish Parliament – in fact, there is a movement of activists and grassroots campaigning across the country and around the world.

New York City Council voted unanimously last year in favour of a series of measures to provide sanitary products free of charge in public schools, prisons and homeless shelters. Council member Julissa Ferreras-Copeland introduced the Bill to ensure that free menstrual products were made available to 300,000 girls and 23,000 women in shelters, and amended the existing law to ensure prisons made products immediately available on request – the change was signed into law in June 2016.

The US movement for menstrual equity has also made its way to the US Congress thanks to Congresswomen Grace Meng, who has introduced the 'Menstrual Equity for All Act 2017'. Feminist activist Jennifer Weiss-Wolf, who was instrumental in getting the New York City Council legislation passed, will also be publishing a book in 2017 exploring the politics behind periods and the recent swell of activism for menstrual equity across the United States.

Here in Scotland, there's also precedent for actions to improve access to sanitary products.

Following my work in raising this issue in the Scottish Parliament, South Lanarkshire College in East Kilbride took the decision to provide free sanitary products on its campus to students and staff via the student union and newly installed dispensers in toilets.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> http://www.dailyrecord.co.uk/news/health/period-poverty-scandal-new-mum-10785833

The college chose to do so as part of its focus on the health and wellbeing of its staff and students, and the belief that providing access to sanitary products will mean a greater focus on teaching and learning, remove some anxiety and stress and tackle embarrassment and stigma around periods. The college has said: "We genuinely believe that having access to these basic hygiene products will have a significant impact on the health and wellbeing of students and staff" – and it expects it to have a "positive effect on attendance and attainment."

In April 2017, the Scottish Trades Union Congress (STUC) passed a motion put forward by the Chartered Society of Physiotherapy which welcomed my cross-party member's business debate from September 2016, and the 'The Homeless Period' organisation, which works with volunteers to ensure tampons and towels are made available through homeless shelters by organising donation drives.

The STUC also resolved to call on the Scottish Government to undertake a review of the affordability of hygiene products in Scotland and to introduce measures to address the inequality of access to products. It noted the view of the Scottish Government that 'feminine hygiene is not a health issue' and adopted the belief that "access to feminine hygiene products is a health issue. To remain healthy and safe during menstruation, women and girls need adequate access to sanitary towels and related products. Health complications, including risk of infection and toxic shock can result from lack of access to feminine hygiene products". It is extremely welcome that this issue is on the radar of trades unions across Scotland, and that the grassroots work being achieved by campaigns like 'The Homeless Period' is being recognised.

Work to address period poverty and access to sanitary products has also been welcomed by the EIS. At its AGM in June 2017, EIS members agreed a motion calling on the Council of the EIS to investigate the cost of providing sanitary products in all schools and colleges as well as promoting the work of South Lanarkshire College and best practice<sup>17</sup>.

There is already a range of exciting and innovative grassroots activism on this issue. I recently hosted a roundtable event in the Scottish Parliament on the topic of period poverty with a number of key stakeholders and individuals who had been in touch over the course of the campaign to raise awareness of this issue in the Parliament.

Representatives from the Homeless Period campaign<sup>18</sup> were in attendance, as were volunteers from project 'The Monthlies', <sup>19</sup> which is an initiative to collect sanitary products for homeless and people of low-income in and around the Edinburgh area.

Another organisation represented at the event was Kalitasha,<sup>20</sup> which creates sanitary products and educational material for girls who are just starting to menstruate. It focuses on the needs of girls in Namibia, where its founder Liita Cairney was born, and does so through the creation of an online fictional character, a 12-year-old girl called Koree, who has just experienced her first period. The

https://projectnaked.org/the-monthlies/

11

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> http://www.eis.org.uk/AGM2017/EqMotions.htm

http://thehomelessperiod.com/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> http://www.firstperiod.org/kalitasha/

website provides factual information about the menstrual cycle and is aimed at young teenagers.

South Lanarkshire College spoke about the progress of its free sanitary products programme, and representatives from the EIS, the Children and Young People's Commissioner and the Simon Community Scotland were also able to give helpful insights around the possible link between menstruation and attendance at school, and the importance of access to sanitary products for women and girls who are homeless.

Glasgow City College students were also represented, and they too have been working on proposals to address the issue of sanitary products at their campus. This is an issue which is very clearly on the radar of students – most recently, the National Union of Students (NUS) passed a motion at its 2017 conference aimed at tackling period poverty and providing sanitary products across all campuses.<sup>21</sup>

I was also fortunate enough to meet an inspiring group of medical students at the University of Glasgow last year, who are tackling the issue of access to sanitary products by joining together to create the GU 'Red Alert' society. They recently engaged in a washbag appeal for the Simon Community in Glasgow, to collect vital sanitary products for homeless individuals across the city.

Filmmaker Alison Piper has also created a video which explores the difficulty of access to sanitary products for pupils in school, when a teenager has her period unexpectedly and is faced with a broken dispenser in the school toilets which means she can't access the vital products that she needs.

All of these inspiring individuals and campaigners deserve to be celebrated. It's fantastic that so many women are already taking action to address the inequality of access to sanitary products, having recognised that period poverty is an issue that is causing the women to suffer.

However, it should not be left to the discretion of individual institutions or individual volunteers to collect or provide these services.

# Current regulation on sanitary products – Scotland and the United Kingdom

There is currently no mechanism or statutory position which ensures the provision of sanitary products to anyone who needs them. Current UK legislation sets out requirements in the Workplace (Health, Safety & Welfare) Regulations 1992 that all female toilets should have the facilities to dispose of sanitary waste, and Scottish Building Standards has requirements for toilet construction generally such as minimum numbers of toilets in certain facilities, ventilation and lighting, but does not touch on the equipment which should be provided in toilets.

The only explicitly mandated provision of sanitary products in Scotland, in law, is for female prisoners. In the existing range of legislation and regulation, both reserved and devolved, which deals with toilets and personal hygiene for the majority of the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Motion 303: <a href="http://www.nusconnect.org.uk/resources/resolutions-passed-national-conference-2017">http://www.nusconnect.org.uk/resources/resolutions-passed-national-conference-2017</a>

population, the mandated provision of sanitary products for menstruation is noticeable only by its absence.

# <u>Prisons</u>

Rule 34(2) of the Prisons and Young Offenders Institutions (Scotland) Rules 2011 states that: "The Governor must provide suitable towels and toiletries as are necessary for the prisoner's health and hygiene, including: (a) soap and shampoo; (b) shaving materials if required; and (c) in the case of female prisoners, sanitary protection."<sup>22</sup>

Information released to me under Freedom of Information legislation in March 2017 revealed that non-branded sanitary products are available to female prisoners and that the annual cost of providing sanitary products for free to the Scottish Prison Service is around £9,000.

# Schools - Scotland

The School Premises (General Requirements and Standards) (Scotland) Regulations 1967 is the main underpinning for standards in school toilets in Scotland.<sup>23</sup> It sets out ratios of children to toilets and toilets to washbasins, requires locks on the toilet doors, and that there should be a place to dispose of sanitary towels from the stage of Primary 4 – but any provision of sanitary products themselves is absent.

The Children and Young People's Commissioner for Scotland recently engaged in a campaign with young people called 'Flushed with success?'<sup>24</sup>. The Commissioner published 'Toilets unblocked: a literature review of school toilets'<sup>25</sup> in 2013, as part of the campaign, which highlighted that the legislation was nearly 50-years-old, and argued that the standards and quality of school toilets for pupils needed to improve. Following a series of parliamentary questions I asked about this, the Scottish Government confirmed it will be setting up a working group to review school toilet guidelines and that it will 'consider' the provision of sanitary products in schools. The group is expected to report by the end of 2017.<sup>26</sup>

# Schools - England and Wales

In England, the School Premises (England) Regulations 2012 make provision for toilets in schools. There is no reference to either the disposal or provision of sanitary products.

In Wales, the Education (School Premises) Regulations 1999 specify the number of toilets that must be provided according to the size of the school population and the age of the children, and the separation of toilets depending on age and gender. The regulations do not include any reference to the disposal or provision of sanitary

https://www.cypcs.org.uk/ufiles/Toilets-Literature-Review.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ssi/2011/331/article/34/made

http://www.legislation.gov.uk/uksi/1967/1199/pdfs/uksi 19671199 en.pdf

https://www.cypcs.org.uk/publications/flushed

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup>http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/parliamentarybusiness/28877.aspx?SearchType=Advance&ReferenceNumbers=S5W-09027&ResultsPerPage=10

products. However, the Welsh Government published *'School Toilets: Good Practice for schools in Wales'* in 2012<sup>27</sup>. This guidance includes a section on female sanitary products and disposal. It includes the following:

- Sanitary machines are placed in all age appropriate girls' toilets (aged 8 or over) where sanitary towels/tampons can be obtained unobtrusively without having to ask an adult.
- Secondary schools: each set of toilets (with two or more toilet cubicles) for girls has a sanitary dispenser.
- Primary schools: a minimum of one set of toilets for girls aged eight and over has a sanitary dispenser.
- All girls are regularly informed (including at the beginning of every school year) that sanitary products are available to obtain in a discreet manner (and from named females) in an emergency at all times.
- Disposal bags or toilet paper are available in cubicles for girls to wrap used sanitary products in.
- Sanitary disposal units are available in all age-appropriate female toilets within individual cubicles. Ordinary bins are not sufficient.
- Sanitary disposal units are emptied sufficiently often, by a registered company, to prevent them from becoming over-full or malodorous.

# Tampon tax

VAT on sanitary products has also been a point of debate in recent years, particularly in the UK. Currently, VAT is reserved to the UK Parliament. Sanitary products are currently taxed at a rate of five per cent. Following sustained campaigning by feminist activists, the UK Government announced in 2016 that it would zero-rate sanitary products and thus end the 'tampon tax'. This amendment is currently on hold until the end of Brexit negotiations, and the Government is currently using the proceeds from VAT on sanitary products (approximately £15 million per year) to support women's charities.

#### Scottish Parliament/Government action to date

Following a parliamentary question that I asked the Scottish Government last year, I received an answer<sup>28</sup> in August 2016 which stated it had thus far carried out no work to assess the impact of the affordability and accessibility of sanitary products on women's health. Instead, the answer given was that menstruation was not a health issue, and that it was the understanding of the Scottish Government that foodbanks could provide hygiene products to women who need them.

There are numerous problems with that approach. Firstly, there is no guarantee that a foodbank will have the appropriate products because they rely on donations. Secondly, there are barriers to access – someone would, in most cases, first need to get a referral to a food bank from a social worker, GP or other professional. After they do this, they then face the indignity of having to ask for products which are essential to their health – products that, as set out above, they are not even

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> http://dera.ioe.ac.uk/13643/7/120124schooltoiletsen Redacted.pdf

http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/parliamentarybusiness/28877.aspx?SearchType=Advance&ReferenceNumbers=S5W-01459&ResultsPerPage=10

guaranteed to receive. Following this response from the Scottish Government, the issue of access to sanitary products in Scotland began to receive national press coverage<sup>29</sup>.

I subsequently led a cross-party debate on the issue in the Parliament in September 2016<sup>30</sup> and I have also raised the issue twice in the chamber with the public health

minister, Aileen Campbell MSP, during General Questions. Following this, the minister met with representatives from the Trussell Trust, who agreed to carry out a questionnaire survey of the foodbank users that they come into contact with, to extract some data on the issue of period poverty. I also raised the issue with Nicola Sturgeon at First Minister's Questions on May 3 2017, where she agreed with me that access to these products is a necessity and not a luxury<sup>31</sup>.

Angela Constance MSP, the Cabinet Secretary for Communities, Social Security and Equalities, subsequently announced on July 11, 2017 that the Scottish Government would launch a six-month pilot scheme in Aberdeen for women and girls on low incomes to receive free sanitary products<sup>32</sup>. I welcome this move as a positive step in the right direction towards addressing the issue of access to sanitary products in Scotland, but believe there is more we can do.

# Why legislate?

I believe that access to sanitary products during menstruation is a basic human right. Therefore, providing sanitary products for free as a collective good to society is necessary to ensure that the rights and needs of those who menstruate are being met. Given the glaring absence in current legislation when it comes to mandating the provision of menstrual sanitary products, I believe that legislation is required to rectify this omission.

The majority of women and girls face an undue financial burden throughout the course of their lives, dealing with something which they cannot control. No-one chooses to menstruate, and those who are struggling financially should not have to face a cost for looking after their essential health. They should never be forced into a situation where they need to make a choice between sanitary provision and other basic needs.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup>http://www.heraldscotland.com/news/14684160.SNP facing calls to explore merits of offering fr ee\_tampons\_in\_Scotland/

<sup>30</sup> http://www.scottishparliament.tv/Archive/Index/fa49d8f0-b878-4be2-b90a-2db81cebbdb0?Area=&categoryld=7c73db9f-2429-48aa-a999-

bb851e6304ac&parentCategoryClicked=False&pageNumber=1&orderByField=ScheduledStart&queryOrder=DESC

<sup>31</sup> http://www.parliament.scot/parliamentarybusiness/report.aspx?r=10924&i=99906&c=0&s=sanitary% 2520products

https://news.gov.scot/news/providing-free-sanitary-products

#### DETAIL OF THE PROPOSED BILL

The principle which underlies my proposed Member's Bill is to ensure that everyone in Scotland who is menstruating should have the ability to access sanitary products for free.

In order to achieve this, my proposed Bill will create a universal right of access to free sanitary products for everyone in Scotland, in addition to specifically introducing a duty on schools, colleges and universities to provide these products in their toilets.

#### What the Bill will do

My proposed Bill will introduce:

- A duty on Scottish Ministers to introduce a universal system of free provision of sanitary products.
- A duty on all schools to provide free sanitary products in school toilets.
- A duty on all colleges and universities to provide free sanitary products in campus toilets.
- Measures to allow Scottish Ministers to extend these duties to other bodies in future, following a period of review, if deemed appropriate or necessary.

# Universal right to access free sanitary products

The proposed Bill places a requirement on Scottish Ministers to establish a universal system which would give free access to sanitary products on request. This would mean the provision of a system in which everyone in Scotland who menstruates would have the right to access sanitary products without charge, regardless of their income and without having to give proof of their identity.

Scottish Ministers may wish to consider modelling this system on the 'C-card' scheme which is currently in place in some health board areas in Scotland for the provision of free condoms, delivered with partnership agencies<sup>33</sup>. Set up of the scheme varies across health board areas but no registration or personal information is required to obtain a C-card or access free condoms – only a date of birth and the first part of a postcode is provided to the C-card worker at the designated distribution point.

Using a similar scheme for menstrual sanitary products would mean that anyone who requires it would be able to obtain sanitary products, for free, at any participating service such as community centres, youth centres, pharmacies, GP surgeries or health clinics. Each individual would be able to choose the sanitary product which best suits their needs, including tampons, towels or menstrual cups, in the same way that the C-card system allows choice between different types of condom.

The different types of product, including the range of types and branding, would be a matter for the health boards and/or partnership agencies to procure. I do not

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Source: http://www.sexualhealthscotland.co.uk/contraception/condoms/male-condoms

anticipate that there should be an age-limit on who should have access to this system. It would be beneficial to obtain different views during the consultation process on the type and number of products which should be made available, including thoughts on preferred locations for access points.

I obtained information from seven health boards who currently operate a 'C-Card' scheme for providing free condoms – NHS Lothian, NHS Lanarkshire<sup>34</sup>, NHS Borders, NHS Dumfries and Galloway, NHS Ayrshire and Arran, NHS Tayside and NHS Highland<sup>35</sup>. From the information provided, a total of 52,464 cards have been issued by these health boards in the last five years. While not directly comparable with a system which will provide free sanitary products, it nonetheless provides a useful basis for comparison.

According to Office for National Statistics data, the combined population for the health boards for which I obtained C-card numbers is approximately 2,252,000. Assuming the male-female population distribution across these health boards areas is the same as the national distribution (49 per cent), the number of males in these areas is approximately 1,104,000. This means there is a five per cent take-up of the C-card scheme among the total male population in these areas.

The actual number in the target group of men in these health board areas who are sexually active<sup>36</sup> and use condoms<sup>37</sup> (i.e. males of sexually active-age range between 16-69) is approximately 284,000. The approximate take-up of the C-card scheme among this target group of men is therefore 19 per cent<sup>38</sup>. C-Cards are available to men and women, and our proposed system of universal access will also be available for all genders

# Free sanitary products in schools, colleges and universities

# Schools

All schools in Scotland would be required to provide sanitary products, for free, in female and gender-neutral school toilets. Young people, up to the age of 16, are legally required to be in education, and the vast majority attend schools. They may be missing out on periods of education if they cannot leave home due to not having the products they need to manage their menstruation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> NHS Lanarkshire operates a C-Card system, and provided details of the cost, but does not collect data on the number of cards distributed. The population of NHS Lanarkshire and number of cards are therefore not used in the calculation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> NHS Highland do not operate a C-Card system, but under FOI legislation released data to me about the cost and number of cards issued under a C-Card Pilot Scheme operated in Argyll and Bute since June 2016. The 650 cards issued as part of that pilot are included in the total 53,464 figure used here to calculate the total issued over the last 5 years.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> 86% of men aged 16-69 had one sexual partner in the last year. Source: (table 5.5) <a href="http://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20151014031114/http://www.ons.gov.uk/ons/rel/lifestyles/contraception-and-sexual-health/2008-09/index.html">http://www.ons.gov.uk/ons/rel/lifestyles/contraception-and-sexual-health/2008-09/index.html</a>

ception-and-sexual-health/2008-09/index.html

37 46% of sexually active men had also used a condom during the year. Source: (table 5.6)

http://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20151014031114/http://www.ons.gov.uk/ons/rel/lifestyles/contra
ception-and-sexual-health/2008-09/index.html

Number of C-Cards issued/Target Male Population  $(1,104,000 \times 86\% \times 46\%) \times 100$ 

So why is there is a need to introduce an additional duty on educational institutions if we are also establishing a universal scheme that can be accessed by all?

During the course of the school day, there is much less flexibility for young people to independently go to a shop and purchase the products they need if they unexpectedly begin to menstruate. The same would be true even if a universally accessible free system is created by Scottish Ministers, as travel to the access point during the school day may not always be feasible. Students in education who menstruate are, either because of their age or simply because they are not in full-time employment, less likely to have access to their own income, and do not have the same ability to either pay for, or get access to, sanitary products during the course of their school, college or university day. Starting their period unexpectedly during class is a stressful and potentially distressing event for a student if they are unable to access vital sanitary products as and when they are required.

Changing the law to require schools to provide these products, free of charge, in their buildings has the potential to improve the health and wellbeing of the students and staff. It could help reduce anxiety among students about the affordability of sanitary products, and ease the pressure of worrying whether they will be able to access the products as and when they need them.

It is for that reason that the proposed Bill includes the additional and specific duty on schools. Additionally, the proposed Bill will require products to be available via dispensers in toilets, and not just available at a central location in the school such as an office or reception desk, in order to grant the greatest possible access and to preserve students' dignity and privacy.

# Colleges and universities

All colleges and universities in Scotland would be required to provide sanitary products, for free, in female and gender-neutral campus toilets.

Students at college and university may not be legally required to attend these institutions in the way that school pupils are but, due to the fact that they are not in full-time employment and are expected to attend classes, they face similar restrictions as pupils at school in terms of being able to afford and access sanitary products as and when they need them.

# Potential impacts of the Bill

- Access to sanitary products for all without having to ask or depend on the goodwill of others.
- Potential for increased attendance and therefore educational attainment in schools, colleges and universities, subsequently leading to better prospects and the opportunity to get out of poverty.
- Women having to take less time off work because they can't afford sanitary products and the subsequent benefit to the economy through fewer lost working days.

# Health implications and potential savings

Between 2006-07 and 2015-16, 67 women in Scotland have been admitted to hospital with toxic shock syndrome. While it cannot be definitively stated from the data whether all these cases are related to tampon use, using a tampon for too long can be one of the causes of this life-threatening condition.

Ensuring that all those who need products during menstruation are able to access them when they need to will reduce the number of health complications and infections which can arise when there is a lack of access to sanitary products. In addition to the benefits of this to the individual, it will also have cost-saving benefits to the NHS by reducing hospital admissions, other medical appointments or prescriptions to treat infections related to poor access to sanitary products.

# **Financial implications**

The provision of free sanitary products will clearly have financial implications in terms of the procurement of the products; potential staffing required for the distribution of products via a universally accessible system and potential transitional costs, such as the cost of installing free dispensers in toilets.

It is expected these costs will fall on the Scottish Government, via allocation to local authorities, health boards and participating partners for procurement of the products. However, I feel that any additional costs should not be considered in isolation but must also be considered against the improved quality of life for those who need vital sanitary products but are unable to afford or access them.

Using average prices of the cost of sanitary products, considering the average number of days of menstruation in Scotland per year, and the average number of products used per year, it is possible to estimate the cost of providing sanitary products for free. However, it should be noted that products would likely be able to be sourced for lower and varying prices when organisations are purchasing them in bulk or choosing non-branded items. Modelling provided by researchers from the Scottish Parliament Information Centre (SPICe) has been used in the following estimates.

The cheapest box of 10 sanitary pads can be purchased for 66p, while the cheapest box of 20 tampons can be bought for 95p from UK supermarkets<sup>39</sup>. If we assume that a pack of 20 sanitary products can be sourced for £1, with a unit price of £0.05. it is possible to calculate estimated costs. It should be noted that these are only approximate costs, based on best estimates of assumed take up and procurement costs.

# Universal System

Assuming that the average person will require around 4–5 products per menstruating day and has 68 menstruating days a year, each person will use 272-340 products, or 13.6 to 17 packs a year, which will cost around £13.60 to £17. At the higher end of the scale where a pack of 20 sanitary products costs £2, or £0.10 per product, the cost would be between £27.20 and £34 per year.

As this scheme would be a universal opt-in for women who choose to use it, rather than the products automatically being issued, it is not expected that take-up will be 100 per cent. Based on the approximate take-up figures for the C-card scheme in Scotland for free condoms (which is the same universal opt-in type of system being proposed here) take-up amongst the whole male population is five per cent and among the target group of sexually active men it is 19 per cent.

Using these figures as comparison, a five per cent take-up rate of the sanitary products scheme – i.e. five per cent of the menstruating population (1,302,000) using the scheme – and assuming a pack of 20 costs £1 - would cost approximately £890,000 to £1,110,000 each year<sup>40</sup>. A 10 per cent take-up rate would cost £1,770,000 to £2,210,000 and a 20 per cent take-up rate<sup>41</sup> would cost between £3,540,000 to £4,430,000 $^{42}$ .

# Schools

Based on pupil census data collected by the Scottish Government, modelling from SPICe estimates that the number of secondary school pupils of menstruating age is around 99,000 and the number of primary school pupils of menstruating age is around 1500. The approximate number of menstruating pupils in Scotland is therefore estimated to be 100,500.

The total number of menstruating days per year for pupils while they are at school is around 3.5 million<sup>43</sup>. Using the assumed cost of £1 per pack of 20 sanitary products, and assuming a take-up rate of 50 per cent (i.e. half of schoolgirls using free products from the school for all their needs on each menstruating school day, the other half not using free school products at all), then the approximate annual cost for

40 Calculation: Number of menstruating individuals x number products used per year x £0.05

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Source: <u>www.mysupermarket.co.uk</u> on 28 July 2017

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> This may be a realistic take-up rate, given that around 20% of the population lives in (relative) poverty. Source: <a href="http://www.gov.scot/Resource/0051/00515392.pdf">http://www.gov.scot/Resource/0051/00515392.pdf</a> (Chart 1A) <sup>42</sup> Rounded to the nearest 10,000

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Each girl has an average of 68 menstruating days/year, but is at school for only 190 days each year.

providing free products in all schools would be between £360,000 to £450,000 a year.

# Colleges and universities

According to figures obtained from SPICe, in academic year 2015-16 there were 142, 738 female students in further education and 136, 545 in higher education. In total this is 279, 283 female students in the college and university sector in Scotland<sup>44</sup>.

Assuming that 50 per cent of students took up the offer of free products provided by colleges and university, using four to five products each for a five-day period, the approximate cost would be between £610,000 and £760,000. This assumes that students would be taking up the free scheme for all of the products they need, on every day of their period while they are at university or college. If students only use the free dispensers once or twice a day while they are at class, or don't have a need to use it consistently, costs will vary accordingly.

It should be noted that South Lanarkshire College is already delivering a system of free product dispensers from its existing budget.

# **Equalities**

#### Gender

I believe that the omission of providing sanitary products for free during menstruation is discriminatory towards the female population, which is disadvantaged by the cost of sanitary products. Managing menstruation safely requires the use of appropriate products, and no-one chooses to menstruate – yet products cannot be accessed without cost. The proposed Bill would reduce this inequality by ensuring a universal system is set up which would allow women and girls to obtain these products for free and by placing a duty on schools, colleges and universities to provide free sanitary products. The proposed Bill will also apply to trans people who still experience menstruation.

#### Age

Young women who are at school are unlikely to have access to their own income, similarly students at college and university are likely to be living on a low income. They are therefore at a disadvantage under the current arrangements. By making provision specifically relating to schools and universities the proposal can help reduce this inequality.

# Disability

It may be that women or girls unable to work and on benefits related to disability will be further financially disadvantaged by having to currently buy sanitary products. Again, the proposed provisions may help reduce this inequality.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Universities and Colleges can be used all year round, but term-time typically is contained to shorter semesters or trimesters. Assuming that students would be in university and college for 6 months of the year (120 days not including weekends) we can make an estimate of costs.

# **Sustainable Development**

The consultation provides examples of girls and women not attending school, college or university due to not having access to sanitary products. The proposed Bill could potentially increase attendance, improve attainment and I believe it will have a positive impact on individuals' lives.

If, by the same logic, women are taking sick days off work due to not being able to having sanitary products, the proposed Bill could help by allowing them to attend work. This will improve their lives (particular those on zero hour contracts who won't get paid if they don't work) and it could also have a positive effect on the economy.

# **QUESTIONS**

# **ABOUT YOU**

1.	Are you responding as:
	<ul><li>an individual – in which case go to Q2A</li><li>on behalf of an organisation? – in which case go to Q2B</li></ul>
2A.	Which of the following best describes you? (If you are a professional or academic, but not in a subject relevant to the consultation, please choose "Member of the public".)  Politician (MSP/MP/Peer/MEP/Councillor) Professional with experience in a relevant subject Academic with expertise in a relevant subject Student (at school, college or university) Other member of the public
2B.	Please select the category which best describes your organisation:    Public sector body (Scottish/UK Government or agency, local authority, NDPB)   School, college or university   Commercial organisation (company, business)   Representative organisation (trade union, professional association)   Third sector (charitable, campaigning, social enterprise, voluntary, non-profit)   Other (e.g. clubs, local groups, groups of individuals, etc.)
3.	Please choose one of the following:  I am content for this response to be attributed to me or my organisation  Please provide your name or the name of your organisation as you wish it to be published:  Name:
	<ul> <li>I would like this response to be anonymous (the response may be published, but no name)</li> <li>I would like this response to be confidential (no part of the response to be published)</li> </ul>
4.	Please provide details of a way in which we can contact you if there are queries regarding your response. (Email is preferred but you can also provide a postal address or phone number. We will not publish these details.)
	Contact details:

# YOUR VIEWS ON THE PROPOSAL

# Aim and approach

1.	Which of the following best expresses your view of the proposed Bill?
	<ul> <li>Fully supportive</li> <li>Partially supportive</li> <li>Neutral (neither support nor oppose)</li> <li>Partially opposed</li> <li>Fully opposed</li> <li>Unsure</li> </ul>
	Please explain the reasons for your response.
Univ	ersal provision of sanitary products
2.	Do you think a universal, card-based system (modelled on the C-card system for free condoms) would be an effective means of providing sanitary products for free to those who need them?
	<ul><li>Yes</li><li>Unsure</li><li>No</li></ul>
	Please explain the reasons for your response.
3.	Which of the following best expresses your view in relation to a card-based system?
	<ul> <li>☐ The card should be available to anyone; card-holders should have unlimited access to free sanitary products</li> <li>☐ The card should be available to anyone; its use should be restricted (e.g. by limiting the number of products that may be claimed each month)</li> <li>☐ The card should be available only to those on low incomes or in receipt of benefits; card-holders should have unlimited access to free sanitary</li> </ul>
	products  ☐ The card should be available only to those on low incomes or in receipt of benefits; its use should be restricted (e.g. by limiting the number of products that may be claimed each month)  ☐ There is no need for a card scheme  ☐ Other (please specify)
	Please explain the reasons for your response.
4.	Do you have a view on which locations would be most suitable for dispensing free sanitary products (e.g. GP surgeries, pharmacies, community centres, health clinics)?

# Schools, colleges and universities

5.	Do you agree that there should be specific obligations on schools, colleges and universities to make sanitary products available for free (via dispensers in toilets)?						
		Yes Unsure No					
	Pleas	e explain the reasons for your response.					
Perso	onal ex	perience (questions 6 and 7 are for individual respondents only)					
6.		you ever struggled to access or afford sanitary products during struation? (e.g. financial barriers, unexpected circumstances, healthes)					
		Yes, frequently Yes, occasionally No Not applicable: I do not need or use sanitary products					
	Π.	I prefer not to say					
Pleas	se expl	ain or give an example of your experience if you feel able to do so.					
7.		itary products were available for free, which of the following would to you?					
		I would expect to claim free products regularly I would expect to claim free products occasionally I would not expect to claim free products Not applicable: I do not need or use sanitary products I prefer not to say					
Pleas	se expl	ain the reasons for your response.					
<u>Finar</u>	ncial in	<u>nplications</u>					
8.		g account of both costs and potential savings, what financial ct would you expect the proposed Bill to have on:					
	(a) G	overnment and the public sector (e.g. local authorities, the NHS)					
		Significant increase in cost Some increase in cost Broadly cost-neutral Some reduction in cost Significant reduction in cost Unsure					

	(b) Colleges and universities					
	Significant increase in cost Some increase in cost Broadly cost-neutral Some reduction in cost Significant reduction in cost Unsure					
	(c) Businesses (including suppliers/retailers of sanitary products)					
	Significant increase in cost Some increase in cost Broadly cost-neutral Some reduction in cost Significant reduction in cost Unsure					
	(d) Individuals (including consumers of sanitary products)					
	Significant increase in cost Some increase in cost Broadly cost-neutral Some reduction in cost Significant reduction in cost Unsure					
	Please explain the reasons for your response.					
9.	Are there ways in which the Bill could achieve its aim more cost- effectively (e.g. by reducing costs or increasing savings)?					
<u>Equa</u>	<u>lities</u>					
10.	What overall impact is the proposed Bill likely to have on equality, taking account of the following protected characteristics (under the Equality Act 2010): age, disability, gender re-assignment, marriage and civil partnership, pregnancy and maternity, race, religion and belief, sex, sexual orientation?					
	<ul> <li>□ Positive</li> <li>□ Slightly positive</li> <li>□ Neutral (neither positive nor negative)</li> <li>□ Slightly negative</li> <li>□ Negative</li> <li>□ Unsure</li> </ul>					

Please explain the reasons for your response.

Sust	<u>ainabil</u>	<u>ity</u>					
12.	Do you consider that the proposed bill can be delivered sustainably, i.e without having likely future disproportionate economic, social and/or environmental impacts?						
		Yes No Unsure					
	Pleas	se explain the reasons for your response.					
<u>Gene</u>	<u>eral</u>						

Do you have any other comments or suggestions on the proposal?

In what ways could any negative impact of the Bill on equality be minimised or avoided?

11.

13.

#### HOW TO RESPOND TO THIS CONSULTATION

You are invited to respond to this consultation by answering the questions in the consultation and by adding any other comments that you consider appropriate.

# Format of responses

You are encouraged to submit your response via an online survey (Smart Survey) if possible, as this is quicker and more efficient both for you and the Parliament. However, if you do not have online access, or prefer not to use Smart Survey, you may also respond by e-mail or in hard copy.

#### Online survey

To respond via Smart Survey, please follow this link:

# http://www.smartsurvey.co.uk/s/EndingPeriodPoverty/

The platform for the online survey is Smart Survey, a third party online survey system enabling the SPCB to collect responses to MSP consultations. Smart Survey is based in the UK and is subject to the requirements of the Data Protection Act 1998. Any information you send in response to this consultation (including personal data and sensitive personal data) will be seen by the MSP progressing the Bill and by specified staff in NGBU, and may be added manually to Smart Survey.

Further information on the handling of your data can be found in the Privacy Notice, which is available either via the Smart Survey link above, or directly from this link:

#### https://www.smartsurvey.co.uk/privacy-policy

#### Electronic or hard copy submissions

If possible, please submit your response electronically – preferably in MS Word document. Please keep formatting of this document to a minimum, and avoid including any personal data other than your name (or the name of the group or organisation on whose behalf you are responding).

Any additional personal data (e.g. contact details) should be provided in the covering e-mail (or a covering letter).

Please make clear whether you are responding as an individual (in a personal capacity) or on behalf of a group or organisation. If you are responding as an individual, you may wish to explain briefly what relevant expertise or experience you have. If you are responding on behalf of an organisation, you may wish to explain the role of that organisation and how the view expressed in the response was arrived at (for example, whether it reflects an established policy or was voted on by members).

#### Where to send responses

Responses prepared electronically should be sent by e-mail to:

monica.lennon.msp@scottish.parliament.uk.

Responses prepared in hard copy should be sent by post to:

Monica Lennon M1.19 Scottish Parliament Edinburgh EH99 1SP

You may also contact Monica Lennon's office by telephone on (0131) 348 6484.

#### **Deadline for responses**

All responses should be received no later than 8 December 2017.

#### How responses are handled

To help inform debate on the matters covered by this consultation and in the interests of openness, please be aware that I would normally expect to publish all responses received on my website www.periodpoverty.scot. As published, responses will normally include the name of the respondent, but other personal data (signatures, addresses and contact details) will not be included.

Copies of all responses will be provided to the Scottish Parliament's Non-Government Bills Unit (NGBU), so it can prepare a summary that I may then lodge with a final proposal (the next stage in the process of securing the right to introduce a Member's Bill). NGBU will treat responses in accordance with the Data Protection Act 1998. The summary may cite, or quote from, your response and may name you as a respondent to the consultation – unless your response is to be anonymous or confidential (see below).

I am also obliged to provide copies of all responses to the Scottish Parliament's Information Centre (SPICe). SPICe may make responses (other than confidential responses) available to MSPs or staff on request.

Requests for anonymity or confidentiality

If you wish your response, or any part of it, to be treated as **anonymous**, please state this clearly. You still need to supply your name, but any response treated as anonymous will be published without the name (attributed only to "Anonymous"), and only the anonymised version will be provided to SPICe. If you request anonymity, it is your responsibility to ensure that the content of your response does not allow you to be identified.

If you wish your response, or any part of it, to be treated as **confidential**, please state this clearly. If the response is treated as confidential (in whole or in part), it (or

the relevant part) will not be published. However, I would still be obliged to provide a complete copy of the response to NGBU, and a copy of any non-confidential parts (i.e. a redacted copy) to SPICe when lodging my final proposal. As the Scottish Parliament is subject to the Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act 2002 (FOISA), it is possible that requests may be made to see your response (or the confidential parts of it) and the Scottish Parliament may be legally obliged to release that information. Further details of the FOISA are provided below.

In summarising the results of this consultation, NGBU will aim to reflect the general content of any confidential response in that summary, but in such a way as to preserve the confidentiality involved. You should also note that members of the committee which considers the proposal and subsequent Bill may have access to the full text of your response even if it has not been published (or published only in part).

# Other exceptions to publication

Where a large number of submissions is received, particularly if they are in very similar terms, it may not be practical or appropriate to publish them all individually. One option may be to publish the text only once, together with a list of the names of those making that response.

There may also be legal reasons for not publishing some or all of a response – for example, if it contains irrelevant, offensive or defamatory statements or material. If I think your response contains such material, it may be returned to you with an invitation to provide a justification for the comments or remove them. If the issue is not resolved to my satisfaction, I may then disregard the response and destroy it.

#### **Data Protection Act 1998**

As an MSP, I must comply with the requirements of the Data Protection Act 1998 which places certain obligations on me when I process personal data. As stated above, I will normally publish your response in full, together with your name, unless you request anonymity or confidentiality. I will not publish your signature or personal contact information, or any other information which could identify you and be defined as personal data.

I may also edit any part of your response which I think could identify a third party, unless that person has provided consent for me to publish it. If you specifically wish me to publish information involving third parties, you must obtain their consent first and this should be included in writing with your submission.

If you consider that your response may raise any other issues concerning the Data Protection Act and wish to discuss this further, please contact me before you submit your response.

Further information about the Data Protection Act can be found at: www.ico.gov.uk.

## Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act 2002

As indicated above, once your response is received by NGBU or is placed in the Scottish Parliament Information Centre (SPICe) or is made available to committees, it is considered to be held by the Parliament and is subject to the requirements of the FOISA. So if the information you send me is requested by third parties the Scottish Parliament is obliged to consider the request and provide the information unless the information falls within one of the exemptions set out in the Act, potentially even if I have agreed to treat all or part of the information in confidence or to publish it anonymously. I cannot therefore guarantee that any other information you send me will not be made public should it be requested under FOI.

Further information about Freedom of Information can be found at:

www.itspublicknowledge.info.



# Rural and remoteness funding review consultation

Issue date: 10 October 2017

Deadline: 4 December 2017

Reference: SFC/CN/01/2017

Summary: To invite comment and feedback on the principles of distributing the rural and

remoteness funding across Scotland's college sector.

FAO: Principals / Chairs / Finance Directors of Scotland's colleges

Further Contact: Martin Smith

information: Job title: Chief Funding and Information Officer

Department: Finance Tel: 0131 313 6528

Email: msmith@sfc.ac.uk



Scottish Funding Council
Apex 2
97 Haymarket Terrace
Edinburgh
EH12 5HD
T 0131 313 6500
F 0131 313 6501
www.sfc.ac.uk

# Rural and remoteness funding review consultation

#### Introduction

- 1. This consultation seeks views on a set of principles to form the basis of decisions on how we allocate rural and remoteness funding. The underlying analysis of the rural and remote areas across Scotland and how these relate to our college regions is provided in further detail in Annex A.
- 2. SFC's view is that the way we determine allocation of rural and remote funding should be kept reasonably simple and not driven by complex formula. We want to shift to a greater focus on how funding is being used effectively to meet the needs of rural areas, placing less emphasis on the metrics to generate allocations. In the interests of institutional stability, we do not propose significant short-term funding changes across college regions. Within the Highlands and Islands region (the region that covers the largest area of rural Scotland) the UHI as the regional strategic body is responsible for ensuring that funding is utilised to best effect including funding to support rural and remote provision. However, the SFC will use the principles we decide following this consultation to inform the Outcome Agreement for the Highlands and Islands region. The funding should help ensure equality of access across and within the college regions.

# **Background**

- 3. SFC is committed to continue to provide additional funding for college provision in rural and remote areas. Annex A provides an overview of the rural and remoteness funding allocations from AY 2010-11 to the current AY 2017-18.
- 4. AY 2017-18 rural and remote funding allocations are shown below:

Table 1: Regional rural and remoteness funding 2017-18

	2017-18 funding
SRUC	£1,550,000
North East	£750,000
Highlands & Islands	£4,988,517
Borders	£463,652
<b>Dumfries &amp; Galloway</b>	£821,973
Dundee & Angus	£350,000
	£8,924,142

5. The current distribution of funding is essentially a legacy – with some amendments – of the metric-driven model used before our wider simplification of college funding, though we have not updated the grant in line with changes in the metrics since then. The previous method of deciding if a college should receive rural and remoteness funding was complex and would work less well under the regional model. Moreover, since it was linked to student numbers (measured as headcount), it would have led to a significant reduction in rural and remoteness funding from those areas where there has been a fall in headcount as colleges have focussed on more substantial courses. Finally, the previous method did not include any method of encouraging or measuring the kind of additional services or provision it was intended to fund. It therefore does not fit well with the outcome agreement approach to funding.

## Why do we allocate rural and remoteness funding?

- 6. Our rationale is that we want students in rural areas so far as is possible to have access to the same range and quality of college provision as those in urban areas.
- 7. In 2010-11 we said that the remoteness element "is intended to recognise specific institutional cost factors that the college is unavoidably subject to, relating to its location or specialist provision. Any such funding is conditional on the college's agreement to continue to work with colleges with broadly similar characteristics to develop and implement collaborative approaches to improve provision for students from remote, rural and island areas".
- 8. The grant letter at that time also stated that we "recognise that there are additional costs associated with operating, for what are often small colleges, in remote (including sparsely populated), rural and island areas of Scotland. The rural and remoteness element aims to reflect the additional costs that such colleges necessarily bear" and are "intended to recognise the consequences of having to provide additional campuses and the subsequent smaller class sizes in sparse populations".
- 9. Our view is that these additional cost factors still apply; moreover if colleges, particularly small colleges, have to offer a reasonably broad curriculum in remote and rural areas there are additional costs relating mainly to:
  - College size not able to make economies of scale.
  - Small class sizes.
  - Multi-campus operations to deliver provision in rural and remote areas.
  - Staff travel, to deliver provision in remote areas (as opposed to student travel which should be covered by student support funds).

## Criteria for receiving rural and remote funding

- 10. Our previous method used the number of students from rural areas and the distance of campuses from other main campuses. We think these work less well in the current college landscape where SFC now funds large regions which sometimes contain single colleges incorporating campuses serving rural areas and in the case of the Highlands and Islands contain a number of rural colleges with varying sizes and degrees of remoteness.
- 11. SFC proposes to move to a simpler method of identifying regions that should receive rurality funding. Through the outcome agreement process, we would work with colleges / regions to ensure the needs of rural and remote areas are met in return for the continuation of this funding.
- 12. Continuation of the funding and future changes in the level up or down of funding would be determined, not by metrics, but through our outcome agreement process, ensuring that regions / colleges maintain their rural campuses and serve the rural catchments at an appropriate level or, where changes are proposed, specify the change in level of service related to the change in funding.
- 13. We do not propose to use rurality on its own as a criterion for longer term continuation of funding as we believe the costs SFC should fund also depend on how a region serves the area. For example, an area may be largely rural, but if the college serves that region through a large urban campus there is no necessary additional costs to support. If a college / region changes the way it supports a rural area we should vary the associated funding.
- 14. However, serving a rural area does need to be a necessary condition for receiving the grant.
- 15. The Scottish Government's urban / rural classifications attached to each postcode area allows us categorise Scotland into 8 groups. These are shown in Annex A, Table 2.
- 16. SFC believes that categories 4 ('Remote small Towns'), 5 ('Very Remote small towns'), 7 ('Remote Rural Areas') and 8 ('Very Remote Rural Areas') should be considered rural and remote for the purposes of determining part of the eligibility for the additional funding for each qualifying area. Around 9.5% of the Scottish population live in these areas.
- 17. Table 3 in Annex A provides a breakdown of the proportion of the population living in these urban and rural areas by local authority. We have also provided a visual map which shows the same rural areas, in which 9.5% of the population reside, in green.

18. Both the map and Table 3 in Annex A, show that areas such as Dundee & Angus, Forth Valley, and Edinburgh / Lothians have a mix of urban and rural areas.

Table 2 below provides a summary of the urban rural population at the college region level.

Table 2: proportion of population residing in rural and remote areas by college region

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	
College Region	Large urban	Other urban	Accessible small towns	Remote small towns	Very remote small towns	Accessible rural	Remote rural	Very remote rural	proportion from rural categories 4,5, 7 & 8
North East	43.6%	16.1%	8.8%	3.7%	0.0%		6.7%	0.6%	
Dundee and Angus	59.0%	23.6%	5.2%	0.0%	0.0%		0.7%	0.0%	0.7%
Ayrshire Forth Valley Edinburgh and the Lothians	0.0% 0.0% 73.2%	60.8% 70.0% 10.5%	15.4% 13.0% 7.4%	4.2% 0.0% 2.2%	0.0% 0.0% 0.0%	15.5%	3.9% 1.1% 0.4%	1.6% 0.3% 0.0%	9.7% 1.5% 2.7%
Scottish Borders Dumfires and Galloway Highlands	0.0% 0.0% 0.3%	25.3% 29.0% 24.7%	21.6% 17.6% 6.7%	5.9% 7.6% 7.6%	0.0% 0.0% 10.7%	26.2%	11.5% 19.5% 10.6%	0.0% 0.1% 22.4%	17.5% 27.2% 51.2%
West Glasgow Lanarkshire	58.9% 92.9% 17.0%	30.0% 3.6% 63.5%	7.8% 2.1% 10.6%	0.0% 0.0% 0.0%	0.0% 0.0% 0.0%	1.4%	0.0% 0.0% 0.7%	0.0% 0.0% 0.0%	0.0% 0.0% 0.7%
Fife West Lothian	0.0% 0.0%	64.3% 78.8%	17.3% 11.1%	0.0% 0.0%	0.0% 0.0%		0.0% 0.0%	0.0% 0.0%	0.0% 0.0%

- 19. The Highlands & Islands Region is clear-cut with 51.2% of its population residing in rural and / or remote areas. However, although the more detailed LA breakdown in Table 3 shows that 53.8% of students from the Highlands LA come from rural and / or remote areas, this LA is served by more than one college, including a city-based college of scale, and considerably smaller colleges serving more rural areas.
- 20. We propose that one of the criteria we use in deciding if college regions qualify for a share of the rural and remoteness funding is that at least 10% of the aggregate regional population are from rural and / or remote areas. As shown in table 4 above, those considered to be rural and / or remote are those from the areas classified as either 4, 5, 7 or 8. The Highlands & Islands, Dumfries & Galloway, North East, Borders all meet this criterion.
- 21. The second criterion is that the college or region has to meet the needs of its area through smaller or remote campuses or through necessarily small cohorts.
- 22. Dundee and Angus College currently receives rural and remoteness funding but would not qualify as rural under our proposed new criteria. It receives this additional funding since it was formed from a merger which included Angus College, which did receive rural funding. We want to support Dundee and Angus College in delivering to the Angus area though its Angus campuses, so we

- can see a rationale for continuing the additional funding. We will, through the outcome agreement process, work with the College to set an appropriate level of funding to meet the needs of the whole region.
- 23. The land-based colleges have historically received rural and remoteness / land-based funding. These colleges are now part of SRUC which does not meet this 10% threshold. However it is a national provider of specialist land-based provision and SFC recognises the need for a separate, specialist, land-based provider and the importance to SRUC of its dispersed and sometimes small campuses. We will therefore continue to support SRUC with additional funding to recognise its specialist national provision across Scotland.
- 24. This would mean that in future purely rural funding would be applied in Highlands & Islands, North East Scotland, Dumfries & Galloway and Borders. The maintenance of the share of SRUC and Dundee & Angus' rural and remoteness funding, although no longer under this banner, will be considered separately.

### Funding allocations to regions / colleges

- 25. SFC's funding allocation would be to regions not individual colleges. In all regions bar one to which we propose to allocate funding this will be one and the same as there is only one college in the region. The exception is the Highlands and Islands. In Highlands and Islands we will expect the Regional Strategic Body to consider the evidence base used by SFC to underpin its regional allocation. This includes the rural breakdown of the region and college catchments. The Highlands and Islands region includes some very small and remote colleges which, necessarily, have multiple small campuses. It also includes relatively large colleges based in cities. Through the outcome agreement process we will agree a distribution of rurality funding that, in line with the principles of the approach we propose in this paper, channels more of the support to the more rural colleges.
- 26. SFC also proposes that the number of physical college campuses that are based in rural / remote locations, and the size of delivery at them, is taken into account when trying to differentiate between allocation amounts to different colleges or regions.
- 27. The government's urban rural classification outlined in Table 2 in Annex A describes geographies from cities to very remote areas. Whilst SFC consider 4 of these categories to be rural for funding purposes, there are clearly 4 different levels of rurality. Table 4 in Annex A provides a breakdown of the Highlands region by these categories and total percentage of the population considered rural. Areas with a greater proportion of the population considered rural, or

within that total considered very rural, in SFC's view should continue to be funded at a higher level.

#### Outcome Agreements and rural and remoteness funding

28. We will agree our expectations through the annual Outcome Agreement process. Therefore, if a college region meets the new criteria for the rural and remote funding, we will agree through the Outcome Agreement process its continued method of serving that area. In that way the funding will be driven by an agreement on meeting the needs of rural and remote communities. The Outcome Agreement process would also become the way in which an evidence-based discussion could lead to changes in level of support in future. Where a college / region ceased to serve a rural area we would reduce or cease rurality funding accordingly.

# Principles of remote and rural funding

- 29. In summary, SFC is proposing that the following set of principles should form the basis of the rural and remoteness funding:
  - To support additional costs associated with small colleges providing a reasonable broad-based curriculum in rural and remote areas – which may include small class sizes, additional campuses in remote areas.
  - College regions will qualify for a share of the rural and remoteness funding only if at least 10% of the aggregate regional population are from rural and / or remote areas. (Rural and / or remote areas are considered to be from those areas classified as either 4, 5, 7 or 8 in table 4 above.)
  - Qualifying regions with a greater share of rural students and with a higher proportion of very rural or remote geographies should receive a higher level of funding.
  - Funding including adjustments up and down should be linked to continued delivery to the areas the college or region serves, demonstrated though the Outcome Agreement process.

#### **Next steps**

- 30. A working group comprising sector and key stakeholder representation met to discuss the funding methodology and to provide advice on the development of this consultation. The College Funding Group was also advised of our intention to consult.
- 31. SFC will consider the responses to the consultation and the timescale for any changes. Our intention is to do so prior to final funding allocations for 2018-19. The overall amount of the rural and remoteness funding and the regional breakdown will be decided by SFC through the Outcome Agreement process.

#### **Further information**

- 32. Please use the <u>proforma at Annex B</u> to respond to this consultation. The deadline for responses is **4 December 2017**. The space available is not intended as a constraint on responses which can be as long as necessary. Please comment on any other areas, which you think are relevant whether or not covered by the questions that are within the scope of the review as detailed above.
- 33. We welcome responses from any interested parties both within the college sector and amongst stakeholders. We intend to publish (anonymised) responses to the consultation on our website as part of our approach to openness and transparency.
- 34. For further information on the principles please contact Martin Smith, Chief Funding & Information Officer, tel: 0131 313 6528, email: <a href="mailto:msmith@sfc.ac.uk">msmith@sfc.ac.uk</a> For further information on the data and analysis please contact Gordon McBride, Assistant Director Analysis, tel: 0131 313 6575, email: <a href="mailto:gmcbride@sfc.ac.uk">gmcbride@sfc.ac.uk</a>.

Lorna MacDonald

L. Maderdd

**Director of Finance**